

From: Phil Jones <p.jones@uea.ac.uk>
To: "Tas van Ommen" <tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au>
Subject: Re: FW: Law Dome 018
Date: Mon Feb 9 09:23:43 2004
Cc: mann@virginia.edu

Dear Tas,

Thanks for the email. Steve McIntyre hasn't contacted me directly about Law Dome (yet), nor about any of the series used in the 1998 Holocene paper or the 2003 GRL one with Mike. I suspect (hope) that he won't. I had some emails with him a few years ago when he wanted to get all the station temperature data we use here in CRU. At that time, I hid behind the fact that some of the data had been received from individuals and not directly from Met Services through the Global Telecommunications Service (GTS) or through GCOS.

I've cc'd Mike on this, just for info. Emails have also been sent to some other paleo people asking for datasets used in 1998 or 2003. Keith Briffa here got one, for example. Here, they have also been in contact with some of Keith's Russian contacts. All seem to relate to trying to get series we've used. In the Russian case, issues relate to the Russian (Rashit Hantemirov) having a paper out with the same series Keith used (for the Yamal Peninsula). Series are different for two reasons. One Keith used the RCS standardization method and secondly Rashit has added some series since Keith got the data a couple of years ago. I'll just sit tight here and do nothing. Mike will likely do the same, but we'll expect another publication in the nearish future.

As for the series for LD you sent us, we used it in the paper for Reviews of Geophysics. This paper has had 4 good reviews and we've just sent back a revised version. This will likely get reviewed by 1 or 2 of the same reviewers of the editor, but I think it will come out this year some time. When it does, we will put all the series onto a web site. Hope this is OK with you. It will unlikely be before our summer months.
Cheers
Phil

At 17:56 09/02/2004 +1100, you wrote:

Dear Phil,

What you will find below is (in reverse chronological order) an email interchange between Steve McIntyre and myself. He has been asking for LD data for a while (since your GRL paper came out) and to my chagrin, I have put him off once already, for reasons I spell out below. For your information, I am close to submitting the full LD isotope record, which I hope to present at SCAR Bremen, along with some interesting spectral analyses and comparison to EPICA Dome C.

Anyway, I am aware of McIntyre's controversial history and am trying to handle things in a non-inflammatory way. He seems not to be troubling me over my own delay, but has asked for data that was used in your Holocene paper of 1998. For this, I have referred him to you. I expect he wants to replicate your synthesis, and so he should use the identical data set, and I give you permission to pass on whatever it was I gave you for that work - with the caveat that it is representative of where the LD proxy record was in 1997, not 2004. I leave it to you to decide how to deal with this - you may prefer to ignore the issue, and I would understand.

Let me know if there is anything I can do to assist.

Cheers,
Tas

Dr Tas van Ommen, Principal Research Scientist	Postal Address:
Australian Antarctic Division and	ACE CRC
Antarctic Climate & Ecosystems CRC	Private Bag 80
Tel: +61 (03) 6226 2981 Fax: +61 (03) 6226 2902	Hobart
[1]www.antcrc.utas.edu.au/~tas	Tasmania 7001
[2]tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au	Australia

-----Original Message-----

From: Tas van Ommen [[3]mailto:tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au]
 Sent: Monday, 9 February 2004 17:46
 To: 'Steve McIntyre'
 Subject: RE: Law Dome 018
 Dear Stephen,

I suggest you ask Phil Jones for a copy of that older data set. Jones et al cite Morgan and van Ommen 1997, although that data set was heavily smoothed (gaussian of rms=13 years from memory), so the one they show is not a direct version of Morgan and van Ommen 1997. I think that I provided them with a high resolution version, and from their notation, it seems that they are using a November-April subset, but you would have to ask Phil - especially if what you seek is to replicate their analyses. Apart from anything else, our set has been continually in a state of development, which is why I have not wanted to widely circulate it until now. Over this period we have had made new measurements (which improved our layer counted dating and filled the gap that you see in Jones et al.), retrieved more cores using better technology and derived a robust gas-tied flow-model that dates the core to 90ky. Now that the new development has ceased, we will soon be releasing the full data set, as I have indicated to you. This is the set I would want to see in wider use, and it is worth noting that it is essentially the same as the portion used by Mann and Jones in their GRL paper in 2003.

All the best,

Tas

Dr Tas van Ommen, Principal Research Scientist	Postal Address:
Australian Antarctic Division and	ACE CRC
Antarctic Climate & Ecosystems CRC	Private Bag 80
Tel: +61 (03) 6226 2981 Fax: +61 (03) 6226 2902	Hobart
[4]www.antcrc.utas.edu.au/~tas	Tasmania 7001
[5]tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au	Australia

-----Original Message-----

From: Steve McIntyre [[6]mailto:stephen.mcintyre@utoronto.ca]
 Sent: Monday, 9 February 2004 09:46
 To: Tas van Ommen
 Subject: Re: Law Dome 018
 There is a Law Dome 018 data set which was used in Jones et al (Holocene 1998) and printed as a graphic. Is this one available? Regards, Steve McIntyre

----- Original Message -----

From: [7]Tas van Ommen
 To: [8]'Steve McIntyre'
 Sent: Saturday, February 07, 2004 11:15 PM
 Subject: RE: Law Dome 018
 Dear Stephen,

The 180 data used in Mann and Jones 2003 was provided as an advance copy in 2003, and you are welcome to have access to it and it will certainly be placed in public archives.

The data in question is part of the full 90 ky isotope record from Law Dome, for which a peer-reviewed dating scale has only recently been published (actually it is in press see van Ommen et al, in press Annals of Glaciology 39 at [9]<http://www.antcrc.utas.edu.au/~tas/home/openaccess.html#vanommen04LD1>). Now this job is done, I am finalizing a paper that will allow me to release the isotope record more widely.

It is this next paper that controls the timeframe for release to you and archives. While I should await peer review for a release to the archives, I am happy to pass on a copy of the data set to you on an advance basis as soon as the paper is submitted I expect in a couple of months. You will appreciate that at this time of the year, we in the south are in our vacation season, not to mention dealing with our Antarctic Summer field program, so I thank you for your patience. Do check back with me in a while if you dont hear more.

Regards,

Tas

-----Original Message-----

From: Steve McIntyre [[10]mailto:stephen.mcintyre@utoronto.ca]

Sent: Sunday, 8 February 2004 6:29 AM

To: Tas Van Ommen

Subject: Law Dome 018

Dear Dr van Ommen,

some time ago I inquired as to the availability of the 018 data set which was used in Mann and Jones 2003. Is this the same data as was used in Jones et al 1998 (Holocene) . Do you plan to archive this data? Otherwise, I would appreciate an email copy of the data.

Thanks for your consideration.

Stephen McIntyre

Prof. Phil Jones

Climatic Research Unit Telephone +44 (0) 1603 592090

School of Environmental Sciences Fax +44 (0) 1603 507784

University of East Anglia

Norwich

Email p.jones@uea.ac.uk

NR4 7TJ

UK

References

1. <http://www.antcrc.utas.edu.au/~tas>
2. <mailto:tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au>
3. <mailto:tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au>
4. <http://www.antcrc.utas.edu.au/~tas>
5. <mailto:tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au>
6. <mailto:stephen.mcintyre@utoronto.ca>
7. <mailto:tas.van.ommen@utas.edu.au>
8. <mailto:stephen.mcintyre@utoronto.ca>
9. <http://www.antcrc.utas.edu.au/~tas/home/openaccess.html#vanommen04LD1>
10. <mailto:stephen.mcintyre@utoronto.ca>