

From: "Michael E. Mann" <mann@virginia.edu>
To: Ellen Mosley-Thompson <thompson.4@osu.edu>, Phil Jones <p.jones@uea.ac.uk>
Subject: Re: 2003ES000354 Decision Letter
Date: Tue, 24 Jun 2003 03:33:46 -0400
Cc: k.briffa@uea.ac.uk, t.osborn@uea.ac.uk, mann@virginia.edu

Hi Ellen,

I'm still travelling, and have only intermittent email access. I'm pretty sure Phil is travelling now too, so I'm hoping Keith or Tim can help out here.

I think we actually discussed two small changes from the final version Phil sent you. This involved adding Malcolm Hughes as a co-author (his name was accidentally left off the list), and changing the wording of one sentence slightly. I believe that Tim and Keith have these changes, and hopefully they can submit this via GEMS? If not, will have to wait until Phil or I have a solid internet connection to do this (that will likely be at IUGG in Sapporo in about 2 weeks).

Thanks for bringing this to our attention. Phil--if you're reading email, any way you can help out here?

thanks all,

mike

At 04:36 PM 6/23/2003 -0400, Ellen Mosley-Thompson wrote:

Phil,

I just learned from AGU that you did not submit the revised version back to AGU via the GEMS system. Can you or Mike do this as soon as possible? I would like to get this paper moving through AGU. Fred Spilhaus still has to approve it - he approves all Forum pieces - so this adds a layer that will cost us time.

Thanks

Ellen

P.S. I have copied everyone who might be able to handle this in your and Mike's absence. Thanks

At 05:13 PM 06/20/2003 +0100, you wrote:

Dear Ellen,

I'm off on Sunday, but I've managed to get the revisions done. The revised pdf is attached. This contains a reduced size manuscript by about 10 lines and we've reduced the

references to the absolute minimum. This is still 30. If we go any lower we have to change the

figures. As we are commenting on a paper we need to specifically reference all the series we

use.

Thanks for going through so quickly.

If further changes are required I won't be here so can you email either Keith Briffa

or Tim Osborn (k.briffa@uea.ac.uk, t.osborn@uea.ac.uk) .

I will ask Keith and Tim to get the copyright forms rolling.

Cheers

Phil

At 13:50 18/06/03 -0400, eos@agu.org wrote:

Dear Dr. Mann: (copy to Phil Jones)

I am pleased to accept "On Past Temperatures and Anomalous late-20th Century Warmth" for publication in Eos with the provision that in your final submission you modify to the first paragraph slightly so that it is fully consistent with the text of the AGU statement on climate change and greenhouse gases:

[1]http://www.agu.org/sci_soc/policy/climate_change_position.html

Note that first sentence of your paper indicates that the AGU statement includes the inference that there is a high probability I cannot find the words high probability in the AGU statement (unlike IPCC that does state "high probability."). It is critical that the introductory paragraph is carefully constructed so as not to diminish any of the points you make in the Forum piece. I suggest a modification of your first paragraph - please feel free to further modify this.

Evidence from Gases," that there is a compelling basis for concern over future climate changes, including increases in global mean surface temperatures, due to increased concentrations of greenhouse gases, primarily from fossil fuel burning.

If this is too long, you might wish to break it into two sentences. This says the same thing as your original intro sentence but is fully consistent with the text of the AGU statement.

Also in the first paragraph would you agree to this change?

... such anomalous warm cannot be fully explained natural factors (Added the word "fully" to indicate that some but not all of the anomalous warming can be explained by natural factors.)

Another suggestion is to remove the second reference to the AGU policy (second paragraph). What about ... these claims in light of the fact that they have The content of the Forum piece is just fine, but I did find a few minor problems that you need to fix in the final submission.

1) 3rd paragraph line 8 - reference to Jones et al. (1998) - this date occurs in several places in the paper and should be Jones et al. 1999; e.g., point (2) line 3

2) page 2 - the second (2) point

last 3 lines: remove double period after U.S.; also that sentence reads awkwardly - try a comma after the word 'cancelling'.

3) the second paragraph of point 2 (2); last three lines: this is awkward; the word "apparent" is out of place; I think this should this read apparent coldness and warmth differ

4) point 3) last line of first paragraph - change ... insight to (Remove in from into)

5) references - the Jones et al. 1999 reference is formatted differently than the rest (put date at end).

Finally - everywhere throughout the text et al should be corrected to et al (The period is consistently absent)

Before publication, your article will be edited to reflect the Eos newspaper style, including a possible change in the headline. We will send the edited version to you for review and final approval before the article is published.

Please note that before we can proceed with production work on your submission, a copyright transfer agreement and reprint order form must be completed and returned to AGU. These forms may be printed* from the AGU web site:

[2]http://www.agu.org/pubs/journal_forms/EosCopyright.pdf

[3]http://www.agu.org/pubs/journal_forms/EosReprint_orders.pdf.

For information on the production process, please contact Shermona Grant, Eos Production Coordinator, at +202.777.7533 or sgrant@agu.org.

In the absence of information from you to the contrary, I am assuming that all authors listed on the manuscript concur with publication in its final accepted form and that neither this manuscript nor any of its essential components have been published previously or submitted to another journal. The AGU Guidelines for Publication emphasize that: "It is unethical for an author to publish manuscripts describing essentially the same research in more than one journal of primary publication."

Thank you for your contribution to Eos.

Sincerely,

Ellen Mosley-Thompson

Editor, Eos

*If you need Adobe Acrobat Reader, it is freely available at:

[4]<http://www.adobe.com/prodindex/acrobat/readstep.html>

Prof. Phil Jones

Climatic Research Unit Telephone +44 (0) 1603 592090

School of Environmental Sciences Fax +44 (0) 1603 507784

University of East Anglia

Norwich Email p.jones@uea.ac.uk

NR4 7TJ

UK -----

Professor Michael E. Mann
Department of Environmental Sciences, Clark Hall
University of Virginia
Charlottesville, VA 22903

e-mail: mann@virginia.edu Phone: (434) 924-7770 FAX: (434) 982-2137

[5]<http://www.evsc.virginia.edu/faculty/people/mann.shtml>

References

1. http://www.agu.org/sci_soc/policy/climate_change_position.html
2. http://www.agu.org/pubs/journal_forms/EosCopyright.pdf
3. http://www.agu.org/pubs/journal_forms/EosReprint_orders.pdf
4. <http://www.adobe.com/prodindex/acrobat/readstep.html>

5. <http://www.evsc.virginia.edu/faculty/people/mann.shtml>