

From: "Michael E. Mann" <mann@virginia.edu>  
To: Phil Jones <p.jones@uea.ac.uk>, Scott Rutherford <srutherford@gso.uri.edu>  
Subject: Re: Figure 1  
Date: Tue, 10 Jun 2003 11:18:17 -0400  
Cc: k.briffa@uea.ac.uk, t.osborn@uea.ac.uk

Sounds great on all counts.

Kevin's comments are all good ones,  
mike

At 04:09 PM 6/10/2003 +0100, Phil Jones wrote:

Scott,

Seems OK. we will send both figures and the text for one last look through today.  
Trying now to incorporate Kevin's comments.

Cheers

Phil

At 10:48 10/06/03 -0400, Scott Rutherford wrote:

Phil and others,

Here is a revised figure. What do you think?

Scott

On Tuesday, June 10, 2003, at 07:21 AM, Phil Jones wrote:

Scott (and Mike if he's still there),

The three of us have been through the text, Fig 1 and decided what to put in Fig 2.

Tim is doing Fig 2 (9 long series - we'll send when we have it). I'm modifying the text

slightly - adding in refs that are missing (mostly with Fig 2) and generally tidying up.

Keith is working on the final sentence of the penultimate para. We all agree with this,

but it could be misinterpreted - so trying to avoid this.

WRT Fig 1.

There are quite a few changes we think would improve things and make it more consistent, all to the labelling.

1. Add et al to Bauer and Gerber (twice).

2. Years only in for Mann et al., so this is the only one where refs would be ambiguous.

3. So, Briffa et al 2000 becomes Briffa and Osborn 1999

4. Briffa et al, 2001 becomes Briffa et al .

5 Remove Long instrumental - the orange line from the plot and key. It isn't explained in the

caption, nor in the text.

6. As the grey line may not be seen under the grey shading, we think that all lines should

be as thin as the grey one. Some are thicker than others - can all be the same thinness.

7. Back to key, change Optimal borehole (Mann et al, 2003) to Mann et al. 2003 (Optimal

borehole) for consistency with the others.

8 . Most important is the SCALING. Needs to be clear which are scaled (to annual) and which

aren't. Text in caption is ambiguous. So can you tell us which is scaled (to annual) and

which aren't. If they are scaled then key should say - scaled 1856-1980 as with Jones et al .

Does this apply to Briffa and Osborn and to Briffa et al (the grey and orange lines).

9. Whilst on scaling are all scaled or regressed? Scaling we think of as giving the same

mean and variance. Regression does this also but which has been used.

10. Finally, Figure would look good with a thin black line along the zero line from 0 to 2000.

Call me or Tim if anything you don't follow. Try Mike as well. I sent him an email earlier

today and he'd already put his reply message up for the next 4-5 weeks.

Cheers

Phil

At 12:25 09/06/03 -0400, Scott Rutherford wrote:

Mike and Phil,

Attached is figure 1. The format is Adobe Illustrator with an embedded PDF. You can view it in Acrobat. Let me know if you have questions.

Regards,

Scott

---

Scott Rutherford

Marine Research Scientist  
Graduate School of Oceanography  
University of Rhode Island  
e-mail: srutherford@gso.uri.edu  
phone: (401) 874-6599  
fax: (401) 874-6811  
snail mail:  
South Ferry Road  
Narragansett, RI 02882

Prof. Phil Jones  
Climatic Research Unit Telephone +44 (0) 1603 592090  
School of Environmental Sciences Fax +44 (0) 1603 507784  
University of East Anglia  
Norwich Email p.jones@uea.ac.uk  
NR4 7TJ  
UK

---

Scott Rutherford

Marine Research Scientist  
Graduate School of Oceanography  
University of Rhode Island  
e-mail: srutherford@gso.uri.edu  
phone: (401) 874-6599  
fax: (401) 874-6811  
snail mail:  
South Ferry Road  
Narragansett, RI 02882

Prof. Phil Jones  
Climatic Research Unit Telephone +44 (0) 1603 592090  
School of Environmental Sciences Fax +44 (0) 1603 507784  
University of East Anglia  
Norwich Email p.jones@uea.ac.uk  
NR4 7TJ  
UK

---

Professor Michael E. Mann  
Department of Environmental Sciences, Clark Hall  
University of Virginia  
Charlottesville, VA 22903

---

e-mail: mann@virginia.edu Phone: (434) 924-7770 FAX: (434) 982-2137  
[1]<http://www.evsc.virginia.edu/faculty/people/mann.shtml>

References

1. <http://www.evsc.virginia.edu/faculty/people/mann.shtml>